

Community Views on the Implementation of Government Employee Recruitment Policy with *Madrasah* Teacher Employment Agreements

Wahyudin Noor, Muhamad

Institut Agama Islam Negeri Syaikh Abdurrahman Siddik, Bangka, Bangka Belitung, Indonesia
e-mail: wahyudin_noor@iainsasbabel.ac.id, muhamad@iainsasbabel.ac.id


Submitted: 25-03-2025

Revised: 16-06-2025

Accepted: 17-07-2025

ABSTRACT. This study aims to analyze the factors that influence the implementation of the Government Employee *madrasah* teacher recruitment policy in the Work Agreement and its implications for the effectiveness of the policy. This study uses a qualitative approach with a policy study method involving document analysis and interviews with relevant stakeholders. The results of the study indicate that applicable regulations have implemented this policy. However, there are still obstacles in planning the formation and placement of educators that hinder the optimization of the policy. Further discussion reveals that although this policy provides job certainty for *madrasah* teachers, the less-than-optimal implementation process can impact the quality of education. Therefore, improvements are needed in the mechanism for planning the formation and distribution of teachers to increase the recruitment policy's effectiveness. Further research is recommended to explore the factors causing the mismatch of formation and its impact on the quality of learning in *madrasahs*.

Keywords: *Effectiveness, Implementation, Madrasah teacher recruitment, Policy*

 <https://doi.org/10.32678/tarbawi.v11i02.11327>

How to Cite Noor, W., & Muhamad, M. (2025). Community Views on the Implementation of Government Employee Recruitment Policy with Madrasah Teacher Employment Agreements. *Tarbawi: Jurnal Keilmuan Manajemen Pendidikan*, 11(02), 213–222. <https://doi.org/10.32678/tarbawi.v11i02.11327>

INTRODUCTION

Recruitment of Government Employees with Work Agreements (*PPPK* in Indonesian) for teachers in *madrasahs* is a strategic step in improving the professionalism of educators. This program is a breakthrough in answering the problem of honorary workers, which has long been an issue in *madrasahs* (Maryono, 2022; Fathuloh et al., 2023; Noerinsan et al., 2025). In addition, this policy reflects the government's commitment to strengthening the quality of Islamic education in Indonesia (Aziz, 2019; Al Mighwar & Nopaulita, 2023). Through this program, *madrasah* teachers are expected to obtain certainty in their career paths and increased welfare (Feng et al., 2021) because the certainty of career development has an impact on performance (Trivellas et al., 2015; Napitupulu et al., 2017; Lee & Lee, 2018).

Although the orientation of the program's objectives is clear, there are still various challenges in its implementation (Sobari & Hartini, 2020; Nugroho et al., 2021; Asyraf et al., 2022; Disurya et al., 2023). The recruitment process, which aims to provide opportunities for honorary teachers, faces technical obstacles that can hinder the effectiveness of the policy. One of the main problems is the limited information and understanding of prospective applicants about the registration procedure, which causes many applicants not to meet the qualifications (Evans et al., 2023). In addition, the

difference in standards between the Ministry of Religion and the Ministry of Education confuses prospective *madrasah* teacher applicants.

From a planning perspective, the PPPK *madrasah* teacher recruitment process is often considered immature and not based on data on needs submitted by the *madrasah*. The PPPK *madrasah* teacher recruitment process is often criticized for its immaturity and lack of alignment with the specific needs of the *madrasah*. This problem stems from inadequate needs analysis and ineffective recruitment strategies, which can hinder the overall quality of education. Planning should be the initial stage of improving the recruitment system, but the opposite is true, where needs analysis is often ignored (Septiana & Septiana, 2023). A comprehensive needs analysis is essential to identify the qualifications and skills required for teaching positions (Murray & Male, 2005; Czerniawski et al., 2017; Benešová & Tupa, 2017). This inconsistency in planning can potentially reduce the trust of *madrasah* institutions in the recruitment system being implemented.

In addition, the aspect of PPPK teacher placement is also a matter of debate. Many parties question the policy of only placing PPPK teachers in State's *madrasah*, while private *madrasahs* also have no different needs (Arifa, 2020; Andina & Arifa, 2021; Nashrullah et al., 2025). Institutionally, state and private *madrasahs* have equal status before the law. This inequality can have negative impacts, such as malpractice of expertise and an imbalance in the distribution of teaching staff. Involving private *madrasahs* in the placement of PPPK teachers can improve the quality of Islamic education (Dhamayanti & Santosa, 2024).

Implementing the PPPK *madrasah* teacher recruitment policy risks the program's credibility in improving the quality of Islamic education (Pohan, 2021). With a large budget, this policy should have a significant impact. The success of policy implementation is primarily determined by professionalism, transparency, and credibility in the process (Marto et al., 2024; Noerinsan et al., 2025). From the perspective of policy implementation theory, success can be measured by achieving its final goals (Grindle & Thomas, 1991). Edward (1984) stated that the effectiveness of policy implementation depends on communication, resources, disposition, and the bureaucratic structure that supports it. Meanwhile, Muthanna and Sang (2023) stated that commitment, planning strategies, and funding can help policymakers and implementers improve the formulation and implementation of current and future education policies.

Furthermore, Goggin et al. (1990) explained that the success of policy implementation is influenced by the driving factors and the capacity of implementing institutions, both at the central and regional levels. If a positive system and environment do not support the policy, its implementation is at risk of failure (Akbar et al., 2020). Therefore, in analyzing the implementation of this policy, this study focuses on the views of three community groups: personnel officials at the Ministry of Religion (Province, Regency/City), PPPK applicants for *madrasah* teachers who passed, and those who did not pass in the Bangka Belitung Islands Province. Based on this, this study aims to identify various challenges in implementing the PPPK recruitment policy for *madrasah* teachers and find solutions to increase its effectiveness.

METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach to explore community views on implementing the Government Employee with Work Agreement recruitment policy for *madrasah* teachers in the Bangka Belitung Islands Province. A qualitative approach was chosen to gain an in-depth understanding of community perspectives on this policy through in-depth interviews, documentation, and focus group discussions (Delamont, 2012; Cooley, 2013; Gibton, 2015; Dewi, 2021; Lichtman, 2023).

Partisipant

The research subjects consisted of three community groups that were relevant to the implementation of the PPPK *madrasah* teacher recruitment policy:

1. Personnel from the leadership elements of the Ministry of Religion Office at the provincial, district, and city levels who manage employees in their respective environments.
2. PPPK teacher participants who passed the test.
3. PPPK teacher participants who did not pass the test.

The selection of informants was carried out using purposive sampling techniques, such as the Snowball technique (Yusof et al., 2022), to ensure that each group of informants could provide relevant perspectives on the issues being studied.

Instrument

The main instruments in this study were in-depth interviews, focus group discussions, and documentation. In-depth interviews explored individual views regarding implementing the PPPK madrasah teacher recruitment policy. In contrast, focus group discussions were conducted to obtain a more holistic perspective from the various groups involved. Documentation was used to strengthen the data obtained through interviews and discussions.

Procedure

Data collection was carried out in several stages. The researcher conducted in-depth interviews with selected informants from three community groups. In addition, the researcher held focus group discussions with relevant participants and collected documents related to the PPPK madrasah teacher recruitment policy. The interview process and focus group discussions were recorded to ensure valid and reliable data. All of these procedures follow applicable research ethics guidelines.

Data analysis

The collected data were analyzed using interactive analysis according to Miles and Huberman (1994), which involves three main stages:

1. Data Reduction: Filtering and simplifying the collected data ensures that only relevant and important information is retained.
2. Data Display: Putting information in an understandable format, like a table or graph, to show the findings.
3. Verification: Evaluating and verifying the results of the data analysis to ensure that the findings obtained reflect the actual conditions.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

The results of this study reveal the views and experiences of three groups of informants—officials at the Ministry of Religious Affairs, as well as honorarium and non-honorarium teachers—on the PPPK teacher recruitment policy at *Madrasahs* in Bangka Belitung, Indonesia. The results of this study are explained below.

Recruitment Planning

The public's view of the PPPK recruitment planning in *Madrasahs* shows a gap between the Ministry of Religious Affairs and honorary teachers. Ministry of Religious Affairs officials said they had planned the recruitment quite carefully by preparing the data and information needed to ensure that the number of teachers needed was achieved. However, several informants from the honorary teacher group felt they were not involved in this planning process, so they felt less prioritized. The Ministry of Religious Affairs Official said, "*The PPPK teacher recruitment planning process has been carried out well. We prepare all teacher needs and identify areas that lack teachers*" (PKA). Meanwhile, according to honorary teachers who passed the selection: "*We as honorary teachers have served for a long time, but did not get enough information related to this planning. We feel marginalized*" (GrL1). Meanwhile, according to honorary teachers who had not passed the selection: "*Many honorary teachers are not recorded in the planning data, which makes us feel that we are not recognized as part of the system*" (GrTL1). This view shows

that despite efforts by the Ministry of Religious Affairs in planning teacher needs, implementing better communication with honorary teachers needs to be improved so that this process is more inclusive and transparent.

Job Vacancy Announcement

Regarding job vacancy announcements, most people feel that announcements regarding PPPK vacancies have been distributed through various communication channels, such as social media, official websites, and direct information at the *madrasah* level. However, there are differences of opinion between the official and honorary teacher groups regarding the clarity and reach of the information. The interview results illustrate, *"We have ensured that job vacancy announcements are distributed through social media and official websites to reach more prospective participants"* (PKA). Meanwhile, a teacher who passed the selection stated: *"I got information through social media and websites, but some of my friends are still confused about the registration process. A more detailed announcement would be beneficial"* (GrL2). Meanwhile, *"We feel that the announcement about this vacancy is not detailed enough. Many feel that they are not prioritized, and some of us only get information too late"* (GrTL2). Here, even though the information has been widely disseminated, there is still a lack of clarity in the delivery of information, which impacts the readiness and participation of the community in this recruitment.

Application Submission

The application process was also a topic of concern in this interview. Many participants felt that the online application system sometimes experienced technical problems that hampered their registration process. However, the Ministry of Religious Affairs has tried to provide additional guidance so prospective participants can overcome these problems. The interview results illustrate that *"We have provided technical guidance and assistance for participants who experience problems in submitting applications. We realize that sometimes there are technical problems, but we are trying to overcome them"* (PKA). In line with that, *"The application process went smoothly for me, but my friends often experienced problems with the system that caused some documents not to be sent properly"* (GrL3). Another teacher stated, *"We had difficulty uploading documents to the system. Sometimes the server was unresponsive, or our documents were not accepted"* (GrTL3). Based on these findings, although there were efforts to facilitate application submission, technical problems in the system were the main obstacle that hampered the smooth running of this process.

Selection Process

The selection process for the PPPK exam in *Madrasahs* showed a difference in perception between officials from the Ministry of Religious Affairs and honorary teachers. Officials from the Ministry of Religious Affairs emphasized that the selection was conducted openly and based on competency. In contrast, honorary teachers who passed the selection felt that the exam was fair, although some felt that the time pressure in the computer-based exam was relatively high. In contrast, honorary teachers who did not pass the selection felt that the selection exam needed more attention to the diversity of religious competencies. The interview results showed, *"We carry out the selection based on competency by prioritizing transparency and accountability. We continue to evaluate so that the process is fair"* (PKA). In line with this, a teacher who passed the selection also stated, *"The selection exam was quite fair, although there were challenges with the CAT system which gave time pressure. However, overall, I feel that my competence is recognized"* (GrL4). However, this differs from teachers who did not pass the selection, who stated, *"I feel that the selection exam needs to pay more attention to deeper aspects of religious education. Some aspects of the exam do not reflect our competence as religious teachers"* (GrTL4). These findings provide information that although there is an emphasis on fairness in selection, adjustments in the examination process must be made to be more inclusive of the diversity of participant competencies.

Announcement of Selection Results

Community views on the announcement of election results indicate an expectation that the selection results will be announced on time and in a transparent manner. Most informants felt the announcement was made quickly through various channels, but some complained about delays and

unclear information in the notification process. It is illustrated by the interview results: "We tried to announce the selection results quickly and on time. However, several technical obstacles hampered us" (PKA). An honorary teacher who passed the selection stated, "I feel that the announcement of the election results was quite fast, although there was a little confusion regarding the procedure for finding out whether I passed or not" (GrL5). Meanwhile, an honorary teacher who had not passed the selection stated, "The selection results were announced quite late, and we felt that we were not given adequate explanation regarding placement or next steps" (GrTL5). These findings indicate that although the election results were announced quickly, communication and procedural issues need to be better addressed to reduce confusion among participants.

The five research findings on public views on the implementation of the PPPK *madrasah* teacher recruitment policy in the Bangka Belitung Islands Province can be summarized in Table 1 below.

Table 1. Summary of Research Findings on Public Views on the Implementation of the PPPK *Madrasah* Teacher Recruitment Policy in the Bangka Belitung Islands Province

Aspect	Views of		
	Ministry of Religion Officials	Honorary Teachers Who Passed the Selection	Honorary Teachers Who Have Not Passed the Selection
Recruitment Planning	It has been well planned, based on the needs of teachers in the <i>madrasah</i>	Lack of information regarding planning, feeling not a priority	Not all honorary teachers are listed in the planning, they feel ignored
Vacancy Announcement	It has been distributed through social media and the official website	The information is quite clear, but there is still confusion in the registration process	Some felt the information was lacking in detail and received too late
Application Submission	Technical guidance and assistance is provided for registration	The process went smoothly, but there were technical difficulties for some participants	Having difficulty uploading documents due to technical system constraints
Selection Process	Selection is based on competency, is transparent and accountable	The exam is fair, but the time pressure in the CAT system is quite high	Feels that the exam does not take into account the specific competencies of religious teachers
Announcement of Selection Results	Try to announce it quickly and on time, even if there are technical difficulties	The announcement was quite fast, but the procedure for finding out the results was a bit confusing	Feel that the selection results were announced too late and there was a lack of explanation about the next steps

Based on the research findings summarized in Table 1, the PPPK teacher recruitment policy in *Madrasah* in Bangka Belitung Province received various responses from the community. Although several aspects have been running well, such as planning and vacancy announcements, challenges must be faced, primarily related to the technical system for submitting applications, computer-based selection, and clarity of the announcement of election results.

Discussion

The findings show that the planning of PPPK recruitment for *madrasah* teachers in Bangka Belitung was considered to have been carried out well by personnel officials but not entirely according to the expectations of honorary teachers. It reflects the difference in perception between policymakers and policy recipients, as Page & Shapiro (1983) expressed that government policies are often perceived differently by the groups affected by them. Meanwhile, transparency in vacancy announcements and selection processes received appreciation from all informant groups, indicating that the communication and technical implementation aspects had gone well (Albu, 2014; Rotty & Pongoh, 2022; Adawiah & Putra, 2024).

This study's results align with the findings of Liorens (2011), who highlighted the importance of transparency in the ASN recruitment process. In addition, the study by Choi et al. (2023) also emphasized that using various communication platforms can increase the effectiveness of

disseminating recruitment information. However, regarding administrative readiness, this study shows that there are still technical obstacles found in the study by Nurdin et al. (2024) regarding obstacles in submitting applications in the SSCASN system. In addition, the study by Ongina et al. (2024) highlighted that CAT-based selection is more efficient and transparent, which is also reflected in the results of this study. However, the problem of late announcements identified in this study was also found in the study by Alifia et al. (2024), which stated that inaccurate announcement schedules often occur in the ASN recruitment system.

From the data obtained, one aspect of concern is the difference in expectations of honorary teachers regarding this policy. Honorary teachers assume that recruitment should provide certainty for those who have served in the *madrasah* for a long time. However, reality shows that the selection process still refers to specific competency standards, which is in line with the study of Werther and Davis (1993) on the importance of meritocracy-based planning in workforce procurement. In addition, the application submission process was relatively free from significant obstacles. However, several technical obstacles, such as document upload errors and system overload, were still found, as Nurdin et al. (2024) explained.

In terms of practice, the results of this study indicate the need for improvements in the recruitment planning aspect, especially in ensuring that the policies implemented are according to the factual conditions in the field. In addition, increasing digital literacy for prospective applicants, optimizing the SSCASN system, and strengthening information management in announcing election results are important steps to increase the effectiveness of the recruitment process. In theory, these findings support the concepts of Suarez et al. (2016), Willis et al. (2018), Yıkıcı and Altınay (2018), and Mahardhika and Raharja (2023) regarding the importance of strategic planning in workforce procurement. In addition, the results of this study enrich the study of the effectiveness of digital-based recruitment and the challenges faced in its implementation, as expressed by Chang et al. (2024).

Although, in general, the implementation of PPPK *madrasah* teacher recruitment has gone well, several limitations must be considered. *First*, the perception of the lack of relevance between planning and policy implementation indicates the need for further evaluation regarding the synchronization of data on honorary workers eligible to participate in the selection. *Second*, technical obstacles in submitting applications and administrative selection indicate that the digitalization system must be further strengthened to reduce the possibility of failure in uploading documents and data inconsistencies. *Third*, the delay in the graduation announcement reflects the need for improvements in schedule management so as not to cause uncertainty for selection participants (Alifia et al., 2024).

In Liorens' study (2011), transparency in workforce recruitment is essential in increasing public trust in government policies. It is relevant to the finding that the announcement of vacancies and the implementation of the selection of PPPK *madrasah* teachers have been carried out openly and can be accessed through various information platforms. However, placing teachers who pass the selection is still a concern. The workforce recruitment policy should focus on selection and fair distribution by needs in the field.

CONCLUSION

The policy of recruiting PPPK *madrasah* teachers is influenced by the content of the policy and the context of its implementation, where the flexibility given to the Ministry of Religious Affairs allows the recruitment of functional personnel to support the vision of an advanced Indonesia and meet the needs of competent teachers. Although the recruitment process has followed applicable norms and procedures, there is still a mismatch between the available formations and the placement of participants who pass the selection, indicating an implementation error. This study identifies the challenges of the PPPK *madrasah* recruitment policy and emphasizes the need for improvements in

each stage to be more effective. For this reason, further research is recommended to explore the factors causing the mismatch between the formation and placement of teachers and examine its impact on the quality of education in *madrasas*, including through comparative studies with the recruitment system of educators in other sectors.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adawiah, A., & Putra, A. H. P. K. (2024). The impact of e-recruitment implementation on company credibility, candidate selection efficiency, and process transparency: Job applicants' perspective. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 14(5), 126-139. <https://doi.org/10.32479/irmm.16721>
- Akbar, I., Yang, Z., Han, F., & Kanat, G. (2020). The influence of negative political environment on sustainable tourism: A study of Aksu-Jabagly world heritage site, Kazakhstan. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 12(1). <https://doi.org/10.3390/SU12010143>
- Al Mighwar, M., & Nopaulita, T. A. (2023). Analysis of government policy towards honorary teachers. *Amandemen: Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Studies*, 1(2), 37-50. <https://doi.org/10.61166/amd.v1i2.31>
- Albu, O. B. (2014). *Transparency in organizing: A performative approach*. Frederiksberg: Copenhagen Business School (CBS).
- Alifia, K. Z., Hudzaifah, J., & Sinabutar, L. M. (2024). Tinjauan yuridis normatif upaya penyelesaian sengketa kepegawaian di Indonesia (Studi kasus putusan nomor 2/G/2021/PTUN. JBI). *Dinamika Hukum*, 25(1), 20-33. <https://doi.org/10.35315/dh.v25i1.9342>
- Andina, E., & Arifa, F. N. (2021). Problematika seleksi dan rekrutmen guru pemerintah di Indonesia. *Aspirasi: Jurnal Masalah-Masalah Sosial*, 12(1), 85-105. <https://doi.org/10.46807/aspirasi.v12i1.2101>
- Arifa, F. N. (2020). PPPK guru sebagai pemenuhan kekurangan tenaga pendidik. *Info Singkat*, XII, 23(1), 13-18.
- Asyraf, M. A., Dameria, E., & Basri, H. (2022). Analysis of the fulfillment of government employee needs with a work agreement (PPPK) according to PP No. 49 of 2018 concerning management of government employees work agreements (Research study of the regional personnel agency office of langkat regency). In *Proceedings of Malikussaleh International Conference on Law, Legal Studies and Social Science (MICoLLS)* (Vol. 2, pp. 00023-00023). <https://doi.org/10.29103/micolls.v2i.95>
- Aziz, M. (2019). Efforts to improve the quality of Islamic education institutions in the millennium era: Case study in MI Darwata Mujur Lor Kroya Cilacap. In *International Conference of Moslem Society* (Vol. 3, pp. 317-329). <https://doi.org/10.24090/icms.2019.2338>
- Benešová, A., & Tupa, J. (2017). Requirements for education and qualification of people in Industry 4.0. *Procedia manufacturing*, 11, 2195-2202. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.promfg.2017.07.366>
- Chang, K., Carrim, N. M., Gupta, M., Cheng, K., & Sandland, S. (2024). Digitalisation of Personnel Recruitment and Selection. In *HRM 5.0: Unpacking the Digitalisation of Human Resource Management* (pp. 87-111). Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-58912-6_5
- Choi, B. G., Choi, J. H., & Malik, S. (2023). Not just for investors: The role of earnings announcements in guiding job seekers. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 76(1), 101588. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jacceco.2023.101588>
- Cooley, A. (2013). Qualitative research in education: The origins, debates, and politics of creating knowledge. *Educational Studies*, 49(3), 247-262. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131946.2013.783834>
- Czerniawski, G., Guberman, A., & MacPhail, A. (2017). The professional developmental needs of higher education-based teacher educators: an international comparative needs

- analysis. *European journal of teacher education*, 40(1), 127-140.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2016.1246528>
- Delamont, S. (Ed.). (2012). *Handbook of qualitative research in education*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Dewi, I. G. (2021). Understanding data collection methods in qualitative research: The perspective of interpretive accounting research. *Journal of Tourism Economics and Policy*, 1(1), 23-34.
<https://doi.org/10.38142/jtep.v1i1.105>
- Dhamayanti, M. Z., & Santosa, A. B. (2024). Dekonstruksi Dilema Guru: Perpindahan Guru Akibat Program P3K dan Dampaknya di Sekolah Swasta.
<https://Journalpedia.Com/1/Index.Php/Epi/Article/View/1528>.
- Dhamayanti, M. Z., & Santosa, A. B. (2024). Dekonstruksi dilema guru: Perpindahan guru akibat program P3K dan dampaknya di sekolah swasta. *Esensi Pendidikan Inspiratif*, 6(2), 147-158.
<https://journalpedia.com/1/index.php/epi/article/view/1528>
- Disurya, R., Danim, S., & Lestari, N. D. (2023). Difficulties in implementing teaching for educators of government officers with work agreements. In *Online Conference of Education Research International (OCERI 2023)* (pp. 507-517). Atlantis Press. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-108-1_49
- Edward, G. C. (Ed.). (1984). *Public policy implementation*. Jai Press.
- Evans, D., Burns, L., Mills, I., Bryce, M., & Hanks, S. (2023). Recruitment and retention in dentistry in the UK: a scoping review to explore the challenges across the UK, with a particular interest in rural and coastal areas. *British Dental Journal*, 1-7. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41415-022-5406-0>
- Fathuloh, F., Junaedi, D., Sa'diyah, T., Zumaillah, E., Zaqiah, Q. Y., & Sopian, S. (2023). Innovation in the field of education personnel: Impact of government appointment policies with work agreement (PPPK) on employee performance case study at MAN 1 Bekasi. *Ta dib Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 12(2), 555-562. <https://doi.org/10.29313/tjpi.v12i2.12290>
- Feng, D., Wang, X., & Guo, X. (2021). The realistic problems of basic education teachers' professional salary and solutions. In *SHS Web of Conferences* (Vol. 123, p. 01023). EDP Sciences. <https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/202112301023>
- Gibton, D. (2015). *Researching education policy, public policy, and policymakers: Qualitative methods and ethical issues*. Routledge.
- Goggin, M. L. et al. (1990). *Implementation, theory and practice: toward a third generation*. Scott, Foresmann and Company.
- Grindle, M. S., & Thomas, J. W. (1991). *Public choices and policy change*. Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Lee, Y., & Lee, J. Y. (2018). A multilevel analysis of individual and organizational factors that influence the relationship between career development and job-performance improvement. *European Journal of Training and Development*, 42(5/6), 286-304.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/EJTD-11-2017-0097>
- Lichtman, M. (2023). *Qualitative research in education: A user's guide*. Routledge.
- Liorens, J. J. (2011). A model of public sector e-recruitment adoption in a time of hyper technological change. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 31(4), 410-423.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0734371X11421498>
- Mahardhika, B. N., & Raharja, S. (2023). The importance of strategic planning with modern trends in education. *Al-Isblah: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 15(2), 1807-1820.
<https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v15i2.2527>
- Marto, L. S., Mayseni, B., Mawaddah, M., Franchika, T. M., & Muslim, M. (2024). Implementasi kebijakan pengangkatan tenaga guru honorer menjadi pegawai pemerintah dengan perjanjian kerja (PPPK) di Kota Palembang. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial, Manajemen, Akuntansi Dan Bisnis*, 4, 182–202. <https://doi.org/10.47747/jismab.v4i4.1671>

- Maryono, D. (2022). Good governance: From state civil servants into government employment agreement (PPPK). *Journal of governance*, 7(2), 547-55. <https://doi.org/10.31506/jog.v7i2.15696>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. Sage.
- Murray, J., & Male, T. (2005). Becoming a teacher educator: Evidence from the field. *Teaching and teacher education*, 21(2), 125-142. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2004.12.006>
- Muthanna, A., & Sang, G. (2023). A conceptual model of the factors affecting education policy implementation. *Education Sciences*, 13(3), 260. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci13030260>
- Napitupulu, S., Haryono, T., Laksmi Riani, A., Sawitri, H. S. R., & Harsono, M. (2017). The impact of career development on employee performance: an empirical study of the public sector in Indonesia. *International Review of Public Administration*, 22(3), 276-299. <https://doi.org/10.1080/12294659.2017.1368003>
- Nashrullah, M., Choiriyah, F., Prasetyo, G. T., & Purwoko, B. (2025). Teacher recruitment: A bibliometric analysis and visualization of emerging trends, challenges and applications. *Nidbomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 41-56. <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndhq.v10i1.49>
- Noerinsan, R., Hatu, R. A., & Sulila, I. (2025). Implementation of government employees with employment agreements policy in teacher functional positions in the Gorontalo Province. *International Journal Papier Public Review*, 6(1), 43-50. <https://doi.org/10.47667/ijppr.v6i1.344>
- Nugroho, A., Kusumaningtyas, R. O., Danendra, R., Aliya, G. F., & Najicha, F. U. (2021). Implementation of worker rights protection for government employees with employment agreements. In *International Conference on Environmental and Energy Policy (ICEEP 2021)* (pp. 102-104). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.211014.023>
- Nurdin, I. P., Fatia, D., Putri, A., Nisa, U., Sjafei, S., Yulianda, R., ... & Sholihah, F. V. (2024). Optimalisasi potensi gen Z di pedesaan dalam mengikuti seleksi CPNS 2024. *Al-Ijtima': Jurnal Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat*, 5(1), 252-259. <https://aijpkm.iaiq.ac.id/index.php/pkm/article/view/150/115>
- Ongina, F. S., Omacar, S., & SSendagi, M. (2024). Human resource recruitment and employees' performance in the national ministry of public service in Juba-South Sudan. *SJ Business Research Africa*, 1(1), 10-10. <https://doi.org/10.51168/sjbusiness.v1i1.28>
- Page, B. I., & Shapiro, R. Y. (1983). Effects of public opinion on policy. *American Political Science Review*, 77(1). <https://doi.org/10.2307/1956018>
- Pohan, M. M. (2021). The quality improvement of educator recruitment and selection system in madrasah. *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Education Studies (IJIES)*, 4(2), 137-149. <https://doi.org/10.33367/ijies.v4i2.1951>
- Rotty, V. N. J., & Pongoh, D. (2022). Urgensi manajemen rekrutmen guru. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Konseling (JPDK)*, 4(6), 12071-12079. <https://doi.org/10.31004/jpdk.v4i6.10375>
- Septiana, H., & Septiana, A. (2023). Employee recruitment, selection, and placement processes: A bibliometric analysis. *Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen Kesatuan*, 11(3). <https://doi.org/10.37641/jimkes.v11i3.2179>
- Sobari, A. M., & Hartini, N. (2020). A study related to "Government employees with agreement" policy in order to overcome problems faced by the contract teachers. In *3rd International Conference on Research of Educational Administration and Management (ICREAM 2019)* (pp. 206-209). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200130.169>
- Suarez, E., Calvo-Mora, A., & Roldán, J. L. (2016). The role of strategic planning in excellence management systems. *European journal of operational research*, 248(2), 532-542. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejor.2015.07.008>
- Trivellas, P., Kakkos, N., Blanas, N., & Santouridis, I. (2015). The impact of career satisfaction on job performance in accounting firms. The mediating effect of general competencies. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 33, 468-476. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671\(15\)01730-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671(15)01730-X)

- Werther, W. B., & Davis, K. (1993). *Human resources and personnel management*. McGraw Hill.
- Willis, G., Cave, S., & Kunc, M. (2018). Strategic workforce planning in healthcare: A multi-methodology approach. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 267(1), 250-263. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejor.2017.11.008>
- Yıkıcı, B., & Altınay, F. (2018). The importance of strategic planning and humanpower in school development. *Quality & Quantity*, 52, 509-520. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-017-0631-3>
- Yusof, M. M., Azman, A., Singh, P. S. J., & Yahaya, M. (2022). A qualitative analysis of the coping strategies of female victimisation after separation. *Journal of human rights and social work*, 1-7. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s41134-021-00199-5>